

Allocating International Responsibility Between Member States and International Organisations

Nikolaos Voulgaris

• H A R T •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

HART PUBLISHING
Bloomsbury Publishing Plc
Kemp House, Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford, OX2 9PH, UK
29 Earlsfort Terrace, Dublin 2, Ireland

HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the Diana logo are
trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc
First published in Great Britain 2019

First published in hardback, 2019
Paperback edition, 2021

Copyright © Nikolaos Voulgaris 2019

Nikolaos Voulgaris has asserted his right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988
to be identified as Author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by
any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information
storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or
damage occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it
can be accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown
Copyright ©. All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is
Parliamentary Copyright ©. This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government
Licence v3.0 (<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>) except
where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union,
<http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2020.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Voulgaris, Nikolaos, author.

Title: Allocating international responsibility between member states
and international organisations / Nikolaos Voulgaris.

Description: Oxford, UK ; Chicago, Illinois : Hart Publishing, 2019. |

Series: Studies in international law ; volume 70 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018059642 (print) | LCCN 2018060032 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781509925735 (EPub) | ISBN 9781509925728 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Tort liability of international agencies. | Government liability
(International law) | United Nations. International Law Commission.

Draft Articles on the Responsibility of International Organisations. | BISAC: LAW / International.

Classification: LCC KZ4850.3 (ebook) | LCC KZ4850.3 .V68 2019 (print) | DDC 341.2—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018059642>

ISBN: HB: 978-1-50992-572-8

PB: 978-1-50994-604-4

PDF: 978-1-50992-574-2

ePub: 978-1-50992-573-5

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon

To find out more about our authors and books visit www.hartpublishing.co.uk. Here you will find
extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	<i>vii</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>Table of Treaties and Unilateral Acts</i>	<i>xxiii</i>

1. Introduction	1
I. Introduction	1
II. Interaction Between International Organisation and Member States	4
III. A Description of the Problem	6
IV. Addressing the Problem	9
A. Aim of the Book	9
B. Progressive Development of International Law in the ARIO	11
C. Structure of the Argument	16
2. The Function and Nature of International Responsibility	21
I. Introduction	21
II. Function of International Responsibility: ‘No Responsibility, No Law’	22
III. International Responsibility and the Subjects of International Law	25
IV. Nature of International Responsibility	26
A. International Responsibility as the Expression of Legal Principles Without Exceptions	26
B. Content of International Responsibility	31
C. Applicability of International Responsibility	37
V. Conclusion	45

PART I

MEMBER STATE-INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION INTERACTION ON THE BASIS OF THE PARTICULAR MEMBER STATE-INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION RELATIONSHIP

3. Reassessing the Particular Member State-International Organisation Relationship	49
I. Introduction	49

xii *Contents*

II. Relationship from an Inside-out Perspective: States in an Organisational Setting	50
III. Relationship from an Outside-in Perspective: Ramifications of the International Organisation's Legal Personality	54
A. Organisational Veil.....	54
B. On Liability and Responsibility: 'Exclusive International Organisation Responsibility' Rule	64
IV. Exceptions to the 'Exclusive International Organisation Responsibility' Rule	71
A. Acceptance of Responsibility	71
B. Third Party Reliance	78
V. Conclusion	82

PART II
MEMBER STATE-INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION
INTERACTION AS INDEPENDENT SUBJECTS
OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

4. The Applicable Responsibility Models	87
I. Introduction	87
II. Direct Responsibility: Responsibility in Connection with Own Conduct.....	89
III. Indirect Responsibility: Responsibility in Connection with the Conduct of Another.....	90
A. Complicity Model	92
B. Derivative Responsibility Model.....	108
IV. Conclusion.....	122
5. Circumvention of Obligations through Member States	124
I. Introduction	124
II. ARIO, Article 17(1) and the Derivative Responsibility Model.....	128
A. Intentional de Jure Restriction of Freedom of Action.....	128
B. Article 17(1) as an Opportunity to Change the Operation of International Organisations.....	132
III. ARIO, Article 17(2) and the Complicity Model	143
A. Authorisation as Facilitation	143
B. Article 17(2) Applied in the UN 1373 Sanctions Regime	146
IV. Conclusion.....	148
6. Circumvention of Obligations through the International Organisation	149
I. Introduction	149

II.	A Legal Analysis of ARIQ, Article 61	150
A.	First Attempt to Delimit the Provision's Scope of Application	151
B.	Responsibility Models in Article 61	153
C.	Second Attempt to Delimit the Provision's Scope of Application	156
III.	ECtHR Case Law and Article 61: A Relationship Lost in Causation.....	159
A.	An Outline of ECtHR Case Law	159
B.	Disentangling ECtHR Case Law from Article 61	169
IV.	Conclusion.....	172

PART III INTERACTIONS INTERTWINED

7.	Responsibility at the Decision-making Level.....	177
I.	Introduction	177
II.	Control from Within/Derivative Responsibility	178
A.	ARIO, Article 59(2): Rules of the International Organisation as a Threshold	178
B.	Political Influence Beyond the Rules of the International Organisation	191
III.	ARIO, Article 58(2): Aid or Assistance	196
A.	Members Off the Hook	196
B.	Complicity to the Test: <i>Chixoy Dam</i> Case.....	198
IV.	Conclusion.....	201
8.	Concluding Remarks	203
	<i>Appendix</i>	206
	<i>Bibliography</i>	211
	<i>Index</i>	225